Environmental DNA assessment of airborne plant and fungal seasonal diversity

Elisa Banchi\textsuperscript{1,2}, Claudio G. Ametrano\textsuperscript{1}, Enrico Tordoni\textsuperscript{1}, David Stankovi\textsuperscript{ć}\textsuperscript{1,3}, Silvia Ongaro\textsuperscript{1}, Mauro Tretiach\textsuperscript{1}, Alberto Pallavicini\textsuperscript{1,2,*}, Lucia Muggia\textsuperscript{1,**}, ARPA Working Group:

Pierluigi Verardo\textsuperscript{a}, Francesca Tassan\textsuperscript{a}, Nadia Trobiani\textsuperscript{b}, Olga Moretti\textsuperscript{c}, Maria Francesca Borney\textsuperscript{d}, Stefania Lazzarin\textsuperscript{e}

\textsuperscript{a} ARPA Friuli Venezia Giulia, Italy
\textsuperscript{b} ARPA Marche, Italy
\textsuperscript{c} ARPA Umbria, Italy
\textsuperscript{d} ARPA Valle d’Aosta, Italy
\textsuperscript{e} ARPA Veneto, Italy

\textsuperscript{1} Department of Life Sciences, University of Trieste, via Giorgieri 10, I-34127 Trieste, Italy
\textsuperscript{2} National Institute of Oceanography and Applied Geophysics - OGS, via Piccard 54, I-34151 Trieste, Italy
\textsuperscript{3} Marine Biology Station, National Institute of Biology, Fornače 41, SLO-6330 Piran, Slovenia

HIGHLIGHTS

- Airborne biodiversity is poorly known: its assessment is key to detect invasive (alien) and pathogen species aerodispersed.
- Plant and fungal airborne diversity was investigated using eDNA metabarcoding.
- A nine-month sampling in five localities and ad hoc primer amplification approach were implemented.
- Plant diversity significantly correlates with seasons, fungal diversity varied according to seasons-localities interaction.
- eDNA metabarcoding is a promising, complementing approach to traditional biomonitoring frameworks.

GRAPHICAL ABSTRACT

Abstract

Accepted 14 June 2020

Environmental DNA (eDNA) metabarcoding and metagenomics analyses can improve taxonomic resolution in biodiversity studies. Only recently, these techniques have been applied in aerobiology, to target bacteria, fungi and plants in airborne samples. Here, we present a nine-month aerobiological study applying eDNA metabarcoding in which we analyzed simultaneously airborne diversity and variation of fungi and plants across five locations in North and Central Italy. We correlated species composition with the ecological characteristics of the sites and the seasons. The most abundant taxa among all sites and seasons were the fungal genera Cladosporium, Alternaria, and Epicoccum and the plant genera Brassica, Corylus, Cupressus and Linum, the latter being much more variable among sites. PERMANOVA and indicator species analyses showed that the plant diversity from air samples is significantly correlated with seasons, while that of fungi varied according to the

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
- Aerobiology

* Correspondence to: A. Pallavicini, Department of Life Sciences, University of Trieste, via Giorgieri 4, I-34127 Trieste, Italy.
** Corresponding author.
E-mail addresses: pallavic@units.it (A. Pallavicini), lmuggia@units.it (L. Muggia).
1. Introduction

Biodiversity assessments are a central focus in multiple fields of research, ranging from estimating the gain and/or loss of species due to ecological factors to the detection of invasive (alien) species, contaminants in food products or clinical allergens and pathogens. In the past years, molecular techniques, such as environmental DNA (eDNA, Taberlet et al., 2012) metabarcoding (targeted amplicon parallel sequencing) have facilitated increased taxonomic resolution in complex communities (Deiner et al., 2017). The analysis of eDNA has revolutionized biodiversity assessments, allowing the detection of elusive or rare species (Deiner et al., 2017; Ruppert et al., 2019). Although eDNA metabarcoding is still a semi-quantitative method (Degois et al., 2017; Holdaway et al., 2017), it has found broad applications in ecology, mainly concerning conservation, biomonitoring and ecosystem assessments (Thomsen and Willerslev, 2015). However, unique characteristics of sample sites and environmental features, in addition to the targeted species/organismal groups, often require study-specific optimization to ensure an appropriate workflow, starting from sampling design to data analysis. Most studies focus on distinct organismal groups individually, e.g., bacteria, plants, rather than a comprehensive perspective of all microbial diversity (Banchi et al., 2019), despite the fact that different components of communities all provide valuable insight in ecological/environmental or clinical/medical contexts.

The vast majority of ecological studies complemented by eDNA metabarcoding analyses have been performed in aquatic and terrestrial environments (Behzad et al., 2015). Recently, airborne particles from diverse habitats have been surveyed by molecular approaches, as reviewed by Banchi et al. (2019). Traditionally, aerobiology, i.e. the study of airborne biological particles (Lacey and West, 2006), relied heavily on microscopy to assess species diversity and abundance. Recent advancements in high-throughput sequencing and eDNA metabarcoding technologies have provided increased taxonomic resolution of airborne biodiversity, including pollen (Kraaijeveld et al., 2015), bacteria (García-Mena et al., 2016) and fungi (Banchi et al., 2018). eDNA metabarcoding is a culture-independent approach, and allows the detection also of those organisms which may not grow in culture, are dead or dormant (An et al., 2018); and it further offers, therefore, the possibility to monitor, estimate, compare and taxonomically assign taxa without the need for specialized expertise at morphological and systematic classification levels. However, studies still suffer from the lack of standardized sampling methods, several biases that can be generated during sampling, DNA extractions and amplifications, sequences which are crucial to estimate the reliability of the results in terms of taxonomic identity and proportion of reads (i.e. relative abundance), preferential amplification, identification of primer biases, false-positive sequences and the presence of any contamination (Lear et al., 2018). The use of mock communities, though, has been reported in about 10% of the studies dealing with eDNA metabarcoding on airborne plants and fungi (Banchi et al., 2019). While bacterial mock communities are commercialized (Lear et al., 2018), few mock communities for fungi have been proposed for standardization (Bakker, 2018; Egan et al., 2018; McTaggart et al., 2019). To the best of our knowledge, there are no standardized mock communities already established for plant and fungi together. Moreover, while studies on bacterial diversity in airborne sample are relatively common, much less has been reported for plants (including higher plants - Streptophytes, and algae - Chlorophytes) and fungi (sometimes co-analyzed with bacteria); even rarer are the studies which report on multiple groups of organisms (Degois et al., 2017 on Eukarya).

To date, few studies have investigated the diversity of airborne pollen (Brennan et al., 2019; Korpelainen and Pietiläinen, 2017; Kraaijeveld et al., 2015) and algae (Sherwood et al., 2017) through eDNA metabarcoding. Among these, only Kraaijeveld et al. (2015) provided an accurate, qualitative and quantitative taxonomic assessment of pollen diversity in the Netherlands, highlighting the potential of this technique to increase the efficiency of pollen monitoring. Kraaijeveld et al. (2015) stressed the importance of this approach to detect allergenic species with finer resolution, such as for grass taxa, which are particularly challenging when only morphological traits are used for their identification. Brennan et al. (2019) also used eDNA metabarcoding to detect seasonal changes in the spatial and temporal distribution of Poaceae pollen throughout the allergy season in the United Kingdom and highlighted how socio-economic advantages might arise from a better knowledge on taxon-specific exposure of pollen and allergic diseases.

In fungal ecology, eDNA metabarcoding has improved our understanding of the diversity of airborne fungi. Fungi are indeed more difficult to survey than plants for multiple reasons. Fungal communities show high spatial variation - even at fine scales (Kubartova et al., 2012; Nacke et al., 2016). Ephemeral environmental conditions, such as humidity, coupled with the reproductive phenology of fungal species influences their occurrence – being seasonal or even depending on the time of the day (Elbert et al., 2007; Kramer, 1982; Pashley et al., 2012). Fungal spores can rapidly be transported over long distances - likely causing fast homogenization of the local atmospheric fungal communities (Abrego et al., 2018; Norros et al., 2014; Rieux et al., 2014).

Despite the improvements in sequencing technologies and molecular-based taxonomic research in the past decades (Cheng et al., 2016; Nilsson et al., 2015; Schoch et al., 2012), knowledge about the global biodiversity of airborne pollen and fungal particles remains limited. Robust, accurate, and consistent taxonomic classification of samples are challenging in molecular-based biodiversity assessments due to the lack of comprehensive, curated DNA reference libraries. In particular, the taxonomic discrimination to the species level is rarely accomplished, and clustering approaches based on sequence similarity have no direct taxonomic comparison (Núñez et al., 2017). Finding solutions to these drawbacks would be particularly important concerning the detection of allergens and pathogenic agents.

Recent studies support the use of eDNA metabarcoding as a promising approach to increase the quality and sensitivity of aerobiological monitoring. Banchi et al. (2018) assessed the taxonomic composition and diversity of airborne fungi in mixed airborne samples gathered during two weeks in four sites of North-Eastern and Central Italy and compared the molecular data with those obtained by traditional microscopy. In that study, the number of fungal taxa identified with DNA metabarcoding was ten-times higher than the number of taxa identified by using traditional microscopy analyses.

Here, we present the first aerobiological study in which both plant and fungal diversity are simultaneously assessed from airborne samples during an extended period of time. Our specific research aims were to
(i) assess the airborne diversity of plants and fungi considering their spatio-temporal variation and (ii) consolidate and improve the pipeline of Banchi et al. (2018) to analyze mixed airborne samples of plants and fungi. We investigated airborne fungal and plant diversity and its variation in space and time across five localities distributed in North and Central Italy for nine months using high-throughput sequencing and eDNA metabarcoding. To assess reliability and amplification biases, we established mock communities of plants and fungi. The mock communities were used in a trial with six selected samples and amplified with different primer combinations to evaluate whether different primer pairs affect the sequencing results. Our results provide valuable perspective into the suitability of eDNA metabarcoding for biomonitoring and routine analyses of air quality at a broad scales.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Sampling

Airborne biological particles were sampled with a volumetric sampler (VPPS 2010, Lanzoni) mounted with sticky tape (Melinex®). The sampling was performed in five Italian sites (Fig. 1) by the collaborators of the units of the Regional Agency for Environmental Protection (ARPA). Air samplers were placed on the roof of the ARPA buildings, located in urban areas, at about 15–20 m from the ground. The general workflow of the study is reported in Fig. 2. The sampling was performed every second week for nine months starting from March to November 2017, including Spring (weeks 1–7), Summer (weeks 8–13) and Autumn (weeks 14–18). The sampling tape was cut according to the sampling days and rolled to fit individually into 1.5 ml tubes; these were sent periodically to the laboratory of the University of Trieste and were stored at room temperature until being processed all together. Each week-long sampling period consisted of five days, from Tuesday to Sunday (for a total of six tape fragments for each sampling week). Mondays were excluded because on each Monday the sampling tape was replaced, and this was done at different time at each sampling station, thus causing inconsistency in the sampling.

Sampling sites were selected to maximize the geographical and climatic diversity over the study area (two sites were selected in North-Eastern Italy, two in Central Italy and one in North-Western Italy; Fig. 1). Sampling sites include: 1) Friuli Venezia Giulia - FVG (Pordenone, 45°57’09.2″N–2°40’54.2″E, 4 m a.s.l.), 2) Marche (Ascoli Piceno, 42°52’50.0″N–13°42’27.4″E, 154 m a.s.l.), 3) Umbria (Terni, 42°34’48.0″N–12°37’59.4″E, 130 m a.s.l.), 4) Valle d’Aosta - VdA (Aosta - St. Christophe, 45°44’31.3″N–7°21’29.97″E, 619 m a.s.l.), and 5) Veneto (Vicenza, 45°31’49.6″N–11°35’24.2″E, 39 m a.s.l.).

2.2. Climatic data

In general, VdA records a lower average of annual temperatures (3.6 °C) than the other four sites (FVG records 11.8 °C, Veneto 11.6 °C, Marche 13.6 °C and Umbria 12.9 °C, respectively). The average annual precipitation is rather homogeneous among the five sites, measuring 1.065 mm in FVG, 797 mm in Marche, 808 mm in Umbria, 840 mm in VdA and 845 mm in Veneto (ISTAT 2010). According to Köppen climate classification, the climate conditions in FVG, Marche, Umbria and Veneto are classified as humid-subtropical (Cfa), while VdA is classified as cold continental (Dfc) (Kottek et al., 2006).

During the sample collection, climatic data were retrieved from regional meteorological stations nearest to the sampling sites (100 m away from the sampling point in FVG and Umbria, 1 km in VdA, 6 km...
Fig. 2. Workflow of the analyses of airborne plant and fungal particles. The three different PCR approaches implemented and compared to evaluate whether the three primer combinations affect sequencing results are indicated by "individual", "mixed" and "primer pair". I PCR: primary PCR; II PCR: outer PCR to attach the molecular identifiers (MID) for multiplex sequencing. The three different PCR amplifications (indicated as “a, b, c”) were performed using one forward (F) primer coupled with three reverse (R) primers.
in Marche, and 10 km in Veneto). Meteorological data were aggregated into two records per month to be comparable with the sampling protocol used for the aerobiological samples. The averages of the following climatic variables were selected for the analysis: mean daily temperature ($T_{ave}$, °C), maximum daily temperature ($T_{max}$, °C), minimum daily temperature ($T_{min}$, °C), daily rainfall ($Prec_{ave}$, mm/day), relative humidity ($Ur_{ave}$, %) and wind speed ($Wind_{ave}$, km/h). Climatic data were standardized (zero mean, unit variance) before statistical analyses.

2.3. Primer design

The simultaneous amplification of both fungal and plant ITS2 was performed using a forward primer coupled with three reverse primers (Fig. 2; Supplementary Materials Fig. 1S). The reverse complement of the primer ITS-u2 (GAAYCATCGARTCTTTGAACGC; Cheng et al., 2016) was used as forward primer and renamed as ITS-u2_f. This primer is located in the 5.8S gene and is the closest to the ITS2 region. The selected three reverse primers were: i) ITS-p4 (CCGGTTATTGATATGCTTAAG; Cheng et al., 2016) to promote the amplification of plant DNA; ii) ITS-f4 (CCGGTTATGATGCTTAAAG), here newly designed, to promote the amplification of fungal DNA [ITS-f4 is a slight modification of ITS-p4 of Cheng et al., 2016 to better complement to ascomycetes and basidiomycetes ITS2 sequences; Supplementary Materials Fig. 1S]; iii) ITS4U_R (TCCTCGGCTTATGATGCTA) to promote the amplification of both plant and fungal DNA at the same time, it was designed starting from the forward primer ITS4F (White et al., 1990).

2.4. Preparation of mock communities

Two mock communities were assembled with plants and fungal samples (Table 1) to test and ensure the reliability of the laboratory workflow and to evaluate to which extent different amounts of starting material may affect the representativeness of different taxa. Plant species were chosen among those growing in the Botanic Garden of the University of Trieste, and both angiosperms and gymnosperms were included. Pollen samples were collected directly from identified plants in season. We took care to include the pollen of Corylus avellana, as it is a well-known allergenic plant. Chlorophyta were chosen among the algal cultures stored at the University of Trieste. Fungal material included both Ascomycota and Basidiomycota and was retrieved either from spores collected in the Botanic Garden or mycelia of fungal cultures available at the laboratory of the University of Trieste. Cladosporium and Alternaria spores, which are among the most commonly recovered airborne fungi, were passively sampled on agar plates, isolated and cultured by the cooperation partner ARPA Valle d’Aosta, while spores of Erysiphe necator were recovered from infected leaves of Vitis vinifera. Erysiphe necator was included because it was detected by microscopy analyses but not highlighted among the sequenced fungi (Banchi et al., 2018). The addition of E. necator to the present mock community aimed at verifying whether this fungus is or not amplifiable and detectable by DNA analyses. The identity of each taxon in the mock communities was confirmed by sequencing the ITS2 region (see methods below).

DNA was extracted from each sample used in the mock communities using the ZR Fungal/Bacterial DNA MicroPrep™ Kit (Zymo Research) and quantified with Qubit™ Fluorometer (Thermo Fisher Scientific). The ITS2 region was amplified with the forward primer ITS3u and the reverse primer ITS4u (Cheng et al., 2016). The PCR reaction mixture contained 3 μl DNA template (10–20 ng), 1× Taq Buffer A (Kapa Biosystems), 1 U Taq DNA Polymerase (Kapa Biosystems), 200 μM dNTPs, 400 nM of each primer in a final volume of 50 μl. The PCR amplifications were performed with the following cycling profile: 95 °C for 3 min and 35 cycles at 95 °C for 30 s, 55 °C for 30 s, 72 °C for 1 min followed by a final extension at 72 °C for 1 min. A negative control (‘no template control’) was used to verify the absence of non-specific amplification products along with the whole amplification and sequencing process. Sanger sequencing of PCR products was performed with an ABI 3130 Genetic Analyzer (Thermo Fisher Scientific). DNA amplifications were then pooled in two mock communities: one in which the samples were mixed in even amount (mock E), the other in which the samples were serially diluted (mock D) into different concentrations (Table 1). The mock D was prepared in this way to include also the DNA of Alternaria and Erysiphe necator, which were extracted and amplified in a too low amount and had to be left out from mock E. The different concentrations of the fungal and plant taxa were proportionally calculated starting from the amount of the extracted DNA.

2.5. DNA extraction of aerobiological samples

DNA extractions from the sampling tape were performed individually for each of the six fragments of the sampling weeks using ZR Fungal/Bacterial DNA MicroPrep™ Kit (Zymo Research) following Banchi et al. (2018). After extraction, the six DNA samples were pooled in equal amount into a single week sample and further processed for DNA metabarcoding analysis. The whole experiment combined a total of 18-week samples for each site; each week was treated further in the analyses as an individual “sample”, resulting in a total of 90 samples. DNA extraction was also performed on six not-exposed tapes (treated as blanks) to assess possible contaminations due to samples processing. These extractions were used as additional negative controls during the subsequent PCR amplifications.

2.6. Library preparation

Amplicons for HTS sequencing of the airborne samples and the mock communities were obtained with two sequentially PCR amplifications following Banchi et al. (2018): the first, primary PCR, amplifies the target sequence (“I PCR” in Fig. 2); the second, outer PCR, is performed to attach the molecular identifiers (MID) for multiplex sequencing to the PCR products (“II PCR” in Fig. 2). For each sample, the two PCR amplifications were performed independently for either of the three primer pairs; the three reactions were pooled after the outer PCR, to ensure that the three PCR products were successfully amplified.

The reaction mix of the primary PCR contained 2 μl DNA template (~10 ng), 8 μl SSOAdvanced™ SYBR® Green Supermix (Bio-Rad) and 200 nM of forward and reverse primers in a final volume of 15 μl. The PCR amplifications were performed in a CFX 96™ PCR System (Bio-Rad) with the following cycling profile: 98 °C for 30 s and 35 cycles at 95 °C for 10 s and 60 °C for 20 s. The reaction mix of the outer PCR contained 0.5 μl of the first PCR product, 8 μl SSOAdvanced™ SYBR® Green Supermix (Bio-Rad) and 200 nM of each primer (10 μM) in a final volume of 15 μl. This cocktail was processed for 12 PCR cycles with the previous amplification conditions. Amplicons were checked for their quality and length by agarose gel electrophoresis, and then pooled to obtain 90 samples and two mock communities (E and D).

2.7. Comparison of primer pairs

We compared three different approaches on six samples randomly selected among each site, to evaluate whether different primer combinations affect the sequencing results (Fig. 2). The PCR reactions were set as follow: (i) primary and outer PCRs were performed as described in previous section (“individual”); (ii) the primary PCR was performed with a mix of all the primers (“mixed”: 200 nM of the forward primer and 200/3 nM of each reverse primers); (iii) primary and outer PCR were performed separately with each primer pair (“primer pair”).

2.8. High throughput sequencing

All the amplicons obtained were run on a 2% agarose gel from which ~400 bp products were gel extracted, quantified with Qubit™...
Fluorimeter (Thermo Fisher Scientific) and pooled in equal amount to prepare two libraries, with 58 and 57 samples, respectively. Both libraries were sequenced with an Ion Torrent Personal Genome Machine (PGM, Thermo Fisher Scientific) on two 316™ chips (Thermo Fisher Scientific).

2.9. Plant and fungal ITS2 reference sequence databases

We prepared two independent reference databases for the ITS2 of plants and fungi. Sequences were retrieved from NCBI, and the ITS region was extracted with ITSx (Bengtsson-Palme et al., 2013). The sequences underwent identity check to remove misidentified records and were clustered at 99% identity with cd-hit (Fu et al., 2012) or edutech (Vavilov et al., 2013). The plant region database (PLANiTS2; Banchi et al., 2020) consisted of 699,968 sequences retrieved from NCBI, which after the ITS2 selection and trimming were reduced to 313,175 sequences. The fungal reference database consisted of 89,814 fungal sequences.

2.10. Sequence data analysis

The sequence data generated for this study are available at the NCBI short read repository under the accession number PRJNA576572. The obtained sequences were de-multiplexed, trimmed (from primers and adapters), and quality filtered (minimum length 200 bp, minimum average quality score 20) with CLC Genomics Workbench v.12 (Qiagen). Reference-based Operational Taxonomic Units (OTUs) clustering and taxonomic assignment were performed with Microbial Genomics module in CLC Genomics Workbench v.12 (Qiagen). The merged fungi and plants reference libraries were used as references. The parameters were set as follow: 97% similarity (70% for the new OTUs), minimum occurrence two (to remove singlets). Taxonomic assignment were also performed in QIIME (Bolyen et al., 2019) with the alignment-based taxonomy consensus method based on vsearch 2.0.3 (Rognes et al., 2016) applying at 97% of identity and the merged fungi and plants libraries as reference.

eDNA metabarcoding analysis allows the detection of invasive/exotic species, which may represent major threats for diverse ecosystems (Pejchar and Mooney, 2009). In our analyses we search specifically for alien species taking as reference fungal and plant alien species lists reported in the DAISIE European Invasive Alien Species (IAS) Database (http://www.europe-aliens.org/) and the checklist of the Italian alien vascular flora (Galasso et al., 2018).

2.11. Statistical analyses

To assess reliability and robustness of the two mock communities, we first performed correlation analysis (Spearman’s ρ) of taxa abundances between mock communities at genus level; the same analysis was performed at phylum level to compare the primer comparison approaches.

Before statistical analyses, sequence data of Streptophyta and Fungi were normalized at genus level to 20,000 reads, and the abundance of each taxa was log(x + 1) transformed. A Permutational Analysis of Variance (PERMANOVA; Anderson, 2001) was computed to investigate the fixed effect of Site (five levels: FVC; Marche, Umbria, VdA, Veneto), Season (three levels: Spring, Summer, Autumn) and their interaction on community composition of plant and fungi, treating the two groups independently. Latent gradients in plants and fungi were assessed through Nonmetric MultiDimensional Scaling (NMDS) using Bray-Curtis similarity and 50 random starts of the initial configuration.

All tests were performed by using Bray-Curtis similarity, 4999 permutations of residuals under a reduced model, and type III sums of squares; when the factor resulted significant, pairwise comparisons were performed using r statistic and 4999 permutations. NMDS and PERMANOVA were performed using PRIMER 6 software (Clarke and Gorley, 2006) and the add-on package PERMANOVA+ (Anderson et al., 2008), whereas all the further statistical analyses were computed in R 3.5.3 (R Core Team 2019). Species Indicator analysis (Dufrène and Legendre, 1997) was calculated to identify the ‘fidelity’ between sets of taxa and the interaction factor between sites and season using ‘indicspecies’ R package (De Caceres and Legendre, 2009); the significance of the relationship was assessed through permutations (n = 999).

The effect of climatic variables on community ordination was assessed through redundancy analysis (RDA, Legendre and Legendre, 2012) computed with ‘vegan’ R package (Oksanen et al., 2019). Furthermore, to assess the importance of climatic variables on community composition on plant and fungi, a forward selection by permutation (999) was adopted for each dataset following the double-stopping criterion proposed in Banchi et al. (2018) and using ‘adespatial’ R package (Dray et al., 2019).

3. Results

3.1. Sequencing

A total of 9,014,361 raw reads (4,498,406 for the first and 4,515,955 for the second chip, respectively) were generated. 5,524,343 reads...
passed the quality filter and had an average length of 265 bp. A total of 3,208,724 reads were retained after CLC Genomics Workbench v.12 (Qiagen), OTUs clustering and the filtering of chimaeras and singletons. These reads represent the final dataset used for the taxonomic assignment and the statistical analyses (Table S1).

### 3.2. Mock communities

Equal amount (E) and serial diluted (D) mock communities were run in duplicate on both chips. The replicates were highly consistent, being the Spearman’s correlation between the taxonomic composition of the equal amount (E) and the one of the two serially diluted (D) mocks highly significant ($p < .01$ and $p = .99$ for both). At the genus level, all the taxa present in the mock communities were also detected in the samples; and Acer campestre, Bjerkandera adusta, Calocybe graveolens, Corylus avellana, Erysiphe necator, Phanerochaete chrysosporium, Polyporus squamosus and Tulipa gesneriana were identified further up to the species level. The proportion of the reads belonging to each taxon in E and D mock communities are shown in Fig. 3A. In the E mock community, containing the same amount of DNA for each species, some taxa were either over- or under-represented (Table 1, Fig. 3A); the same is also observed in the D mock community, after the read numbers were normalized to the initial DNA amount (Table 1, Fig. 3A). The pattern of most of the taxa remains the same in the two approaches, while Campanula sp. and Wisteria sp. were more influenced by the initial amount of DNA. Fungal samples originating from spores were in general under-represented.

### 3.3. Primer pair comparison

The taxonomic composition at kingdom and phylum level coming from the different primer combinations summing the reads of the six samples is reported in Fig. 3B. As expected, plants (Streptophyta and Chlorophyta) were amplified most effectively with primers ITS4U_R (60%) and ITS-p4 (~58%), and at the least using primer ITS-f4 and the “mixed” approach (32% for both). Fungi were best amplified with the “mixed” approach (65%) and with primer ITS-f4 (61%) and at the least using primer ITS-p4 (33%). The lowest amount of reads which could not be assigned to any fungal or plant group was recovered using the primer ITS4U_R in the “primer approach”. The Spearman’s correlation among samples was significant for all the comparisons (Table 2).

### 3.4. Spatio-temporal diversity patterns

Due to technical problems of the sampler in Marche, samples from three weeks (M8, M10, M15) were lost; therefore only 87 total samples could be further analyzed. The CLC Workbench (Qiagen) assigned at kingdom level 62% of the reads to Fungi and 24% to Plants, while 14% remained unassigned. The results with QIIME2 are largely in accordance with those obtained with CLC (Supplementary Material Fig. S2), and

![Abundances of taxa reported with the percentage values of reads for (A) the mock communities and (B) the six samples amplified with the three PCR approaches.](image)

#### Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Individual</th>
<th>Mixed</th>
<th>ITS-f4</th>
<th>ITS-p4</th>
<th>ITS4U_R</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>0.94**</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITS-f4</td>
<td>0.89*</td>
<td>1**</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITS-p4</td>
<td>0.94*</td>
<td>0.89*</td>
<td>0.94*</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITS4U_R</td>
<td>1**</td>
<td>0.94*</td>
<td>0.89*</td>
<td>0.94*</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** $p < .01$.  
* $p < .05$.
here we report the results from the CLC Workbench. Overall, the taxonomic composition at genus level was represented by 158 plant genera (153 Streptophyta and 5 Chlorophyta) and 613 fungal genera (349 Ascomycota, 259 Basidiomycota and 5 Mucoromycotina; Supplementary Materials Table S2).

A total of 43 alien plant species were detected in our dataset (Supplementary Materials Table S3) and are represented by invasive (12 species), naturalized (16) and random (15) species. In particular, the most abundant IAS across all sites was *Robinia pseudoacacia*. The established fungal plant pathogens detected were *Cryptostroma corticale*, *Fusarium proliferatum* and *Colletotrichum gloeosporioides* (Supplementary Materials Table S3).

The most abundant plant genera at site level and across all seasons were: *Corylus*, *Brassica* and *Linum* in FVG and VdA (18%, 11% and 7%,

**Fig. 4.** Taxonomic composition at genus level in the three seasons for the five sampling sites for plants (A) and fungi (B). Abundances of taxa are reported with the percentage values of reads. The most abundant genera are showed (>20% for plants, >10% for fungi), while the less abundant are grouped under "Other".
32%, 17% and 8%, respectively); *Brassica* (17%), *Cupressus* (14%) and *Linum* (7%) in Marche; *Corylus* (32%), *Brassica* (12%) and *Daucus* (7%) in Umbria; and *Corylus* (36%), *Brassica* (17%) and the green alga *Coccomyxa* (6%) in Veneto (Supplementary Materials Table S4). Seasonal variation was also observed. Considering all sites, in the spring, *Corylus* was the most abundant (57%), followed by *Cupressus* (7%) and the green alga *Coccomyxa* (6%); in summer, *Brassica*, *Linum* (9%) and *Daucus* (9%); and in autumn, *Brassica* (24%), *Linum* (12%) and *Rubus* (8%) (Supplementary Materials Table S5).

The most abundant fungal taxa at site level and across all seasons, were *Cladosporium* (34%, 40%, 19% and 44% respectively), *Alternaria* (23%, 6%, 12% and 15% respectively) and *Epidermophyton* (15%, 19%, 8% and 8% respectively) in FVG, Marche, VdA and Veneto, while *Cladosporium* (38%), *Calocybe* (13%) and *Alternaria* (11%) were the most abundant in Umbria (Supplementary Materials Table S4). Seasonal variation was also observed. Considering all sites, in spring *Cladosporium* was the most abundant (57%) followed by *Alternaria* (11%) and *Calocybe* (9%), while in summer and autumn, *Cladosporium* (34% each), *Alternaria* (14% and 17% respectively) and *Epidermophyton* (15% and 10% respectively) dominated (Supplementary Materials Table S5).

Taking into account both sites and seasons for plants, *Corylus* was the most abundant genus in spring for all sites but Marche, in which *Cupressus* was prevailing (Fig. 4A). Summer and autumn share the most abundant genus in spring for all sites but Marche, in which *Linum* was prevailing (Fig. 4A). Summer and autumn share the most abundant genus in spring for all sites but Marche, in which *Linum* was prevailing (Fig. 4A). Summer and autumn share the most abundant genus in spring for all sites but Marche, in which *Linum* was prevailing (Fig. 4A). Summer and autumn share the most abundant genus in spring for all sites but Marche, in which *Linum* was prevailing (Fig. 4A).

### 4. Discussion

#### 4.1. Simultaneous amplification of plant and fungal DNA from microbiological samples

eDNA metabarcoding studies have usually focused on single organismal groups, e.g., bacteria, fungi, metazoa, etc., or single species, e.g., rare or threatened species, invasive species etc., in a multiplicity of biotic and abiotic systems (Banchi et al., 2019; Deiner et al., 2017; Taberlet et al., 2012). In microbiology, eDNA metabarcoding studies have either focused on plants, fungi and/or bacteria in indoor and outdoor environments; however, only a few report on the simultaneous analyses of either two of these three organismal groups (Banchi et al., 2019, and references therein). Aerobiological samples are indeed complexes of taxa belonging to different kingdoms, including pollen, fungal spores, plant and fungal fragments, bacteria, algae, and other biodiversity. Members of the airborne communities are present in different relative abundances, and the detection and characterization of the complex communities remains challenging.

In this study, the combination of eDNA metabarcoding and HTS technology was successfully applied to detect and characterize the airborne diversity of plants and fungi simultaneously in a nine-month long survey. This was achieved by using multiple combinations of primers to detect both organismal groups. Primers were selected or newly designed to comprehensively capture the taxonomic diversity of the targeted communities. The performance of different primer combinations has been screened for different organisms and sequencing platforms implemented commonly used (e.g. Banos et al., 2018; Bylémans et al., 2018; Riit et al., 2016). Primer specificity is known to represent a key factor in capturing the full range of organismal diversity in mixed samples, especially if the selected barcode is the same for different groups. The ITS region is a common DNA barcode for species identification, designated as a universal barcode for fungi (Nilsson et al., 2009; Schoch et al., 2012), and often used also for plants (Johnson et al., 2019; Kress, 2017; Tremblay et al., 2018), as in this study. As the ITS marker meets the characteristics of a DNA barcode in many cases (Kress and Erickson, 2008), it is suitable for designing primers with a wide range of coverage for different groups of taxa (Cheng et al., 2016; Ruppert et al., 2019). Here, we tested three different primer combinations – using commonly used primers and others that were slightly modified to amplify a broader range of organisms. We also used three different PCR approaches to prepare the libraries for sequencing. The primer pairs were either used individually in single PCR reactions or mixed in the same PCR reaction to produce at the end five different types of libraries which were sequenced. The approach which performed best, capturing the greatest diversity of airborne plants and fungi, and was therefore applied for all samples, was the “individual” one, in which each sample was firstly amplified using all three primer combinations individually, and subsequently these three PCR products were pooled to prepare the library. In this “individual” type of amplification, both plants and fungi were amplified starting from an equal amount of DNA. However, among plants, Chlorophyta could be better amplified and sequenced than in the other two amplification approaches “mixed” and “primer pairs”, respectively. The “mixed” approach seemed to favor the amplification of fungi, hinting to a possible higher affinity of primers (i.e. higher annealing efficiency) to fungal DNA in mixed samples. Also, in this “mixed” approach, the proportion of sequenced fungal taxa almost corresponded to that obtained using only the fungal-specific primer pair ITS-u2F/ITS-f4. However, if primer pairs are used individually, the pair ITS-u2F/ITS4u-R is the one which performs best. It amplified both plants and fungi of all targeted groups (i.e. Streptophyta, Chlorophyta, Ascomycota and Basidiomycota), and generated the lowest amount of sequences which remained unassigned. However, the selection of optimal fungal ITS primers still remains unresolved. Li et al. (2019) recently demonstrated that three primers sets could not reach a consensus on fungal community compositions or diversities, and

### Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of variation</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>Pseudo-F</th>
<th>Variance explained (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Plants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2005.6</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>0.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Season</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>17,178</td>
<td>9.59**</td>
<td>23.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site × Season</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1863.9</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>1847</td>
<td></td>
<td>76.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fungi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3436.3</td>
<td>1.92***</td>
<td>4.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Season</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7323.5</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td>8.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site × Residual</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3271.6</td>
<td>1.83***</td>
<td>11.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>1790</td>
<td></td>
<td>76.41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** p < .001.  
* p < .01.  
*. p < .05.

---

E. Banchi et al. / Science of the Total Environment 738 (2020) 140249
that primer selection determined the observed diversity and composition in soil fungal communities.

4.2. The importance of mock community in eDNA metabarcoding

A standardized mock community represents an invaluable control in amplicon sequencing studies (Yeh et al., 2018). Though this type of control has been largely neglected at the beginning of the HTS technology, mock communities have been shown to be essential to estimate the reliability of the sequencing results and potential biases related to the eDNA metabarcoding technique (Lear et al., 2018; Rocchi et al., 2017). Increasingly, researchers now include specific, often ad hoc-created, mock communities to improve or compare different PCR conditions or to evaluate error rates in the final datasets (Bakker, 2018). Mock communities can be prepared according to different experimental designs, either assembling the DNA of the various taxa in even or in staggered abundances (simulating the different abundances of species as naturally present in many microbial communities), or selecting different genetic

---

**Fig. 5.** Redundancy analyses (RDA) based on (A) plants and (B) fungi. Black dots represent sampling sites, red vectors species, and blue vectors climatic variables. Both RDAs were calculated using log(x + 1) transformed species abundance data. The climatic variables displayed here are those retained after forward selection procedure. (For interpretation of the references to color in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)
markers, or they can be used to process the sequenced reads with different pipelines and compare the outputs (Bakker, 2018). Recently three mock communities have been proposed for fungi by Bakker (2018). Others have been developed for specific analyses in environmental and medical contexts, such as for arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (Egan et al., 2018) and fungi in the respiratory tract (McTaggart et al., 2019), but to our knowledge none has been established for mixed samples of plant and fungi together so far.

The two mock communities assembled for this study were comprised of plants and fungi using even and staggered amounts of DNA, including taxa that were expected to be present in the analyzed airborne samples. In particular, these two types of mock communities mirrored the analyzed airborne samples, in which fungal spores or pollen of some taxa can be much more abundant than others. Our mock communities showed high level of reproducibility among the two different sequencing runs and a high level of taxonomic resolution: all the taxa could be identified to the genus level and the half of the taxa up to their species level. Though the preparation of fungal mock community from non-axenic tissues or cultures can be criticized to be a source of contaminations (Bakker, 2018), all the reads that we detected belonged to the community without off-target species, confirming the robustness of the pipelines followed for both the laboratory work and data analysis.

The interpretation of eDNA metabarcoding as a quantitative technique is still debated (Banchi et al., 2019; Lamb et al., 2018 and references therein), because the proportion of reads does not reliably represent the abundance of a certain taxon in the community. Nevertheless, a consensus has been found in considering it a semi-quantitative and not just a presence/absence approach (Amed et al., 2010; Rocchi et al., 2017). This statement is also evidenced by the analyses of our mock communities. Indeed, the sequencing results of the “even” mock community show how some taxa were significantly over-represented and other underrepresented. This disproportion is, though, less accentuated in the staggered mock community, where the originally different amounts of DNA influenced the proportion of reads, being the most abundant taxa those for which the highest number of reads was recovered. However, we here have not taken into account the quantity of DNA each species has, which defines the number of gene copies of the targeted marker (ITS2; Lofgren et al., 2019; Bradshaw et al., 2020) and may impair the results of the PCR amplifications (Schoch et al., 2012). It is likely that future researches will succeed in correlating the amount of the target gene by quantitative PCR (qPCR).

4.3. Airborne plant and fungal diversity relates to spatial and temporal variables

Our analyses recovered reads from 158 plant (153 Streptophyta and 5 Chlorophyta) and 613 fungal genera (349 Ascomycota, 259 Basidiomycota and 5 Mucoromycotina) across the five Italian localities in a nine-month long sampling. These results captured nearly 10 times the diversity obtained by the daily traditional morphological analyses of pollen and spores that are reported by the regional ARPA agencies (www.pollnet.it). Furthermore, these results can potentially be used in assessing the patterns of occurrence and spread of plants and fungi according to climatic conditions. A better understanding of these patterns may be of particular interest especially when allergic taxa are detected, allowing for the knowledge of their dispersion patterns and the recommendations of useful guidelines needed for future prevention actions (Sicard et al., 2019). Simulations of pollen and spore dispersion in Europe have been based on results of local and short-term studies and have focused on only a few species (Sofiev et al., 2013; Veriankanité et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2014). The variation of fungal communities across space and time was somehow quite expected; in fact, fungal spores usually have longer atmospheric residence times with respect to pollen grains, being transported up to thousands of kilometers away from their source (Mayol et al., 2017). Cladosporium, Alternaria, Epicoccum and Caloeybe are considered the most abundant genera (listed in the order of their abundance), even though there is a significant difference mainly for the less abundant taxa, such as Sporormiella and Oidium. For these, the more local occurrence may suggest the presence of certain micromches specifically occupied by them. In contrast, plant community showed only temporal variation and localities seem not to play a significant role. Corylus was the most abundant genus recovered in spring for all sites except for Marche (for which Cupressus was prevailing), whereas in summer and autumn the highest abundance was detected for Brassica followed by Linum, Cucurmis and Daucus in all the sampling stations.

Contrasting hypotheses have been formulated to explain airborne particle composition (i.e. local vs external sources). While the external sources hypothesis predicts that propagules can be transported miles away from their origin under suitable weather conditions (Damialis et al., 2017; Mayol et al., 2017), local source hypothesis foresees that airborne particles originate close to the sampling station (Skjæth et al., 2012; Oteros et al., 2015; Rojo et al., 2015). Our findings tend to support the local source hypothesis (see Table 3). Indeed, if propagules were transported far from their origin, we would expect a higher degree of similarity among sites and seasons, which is in conflict with the observed pattern of strong variation among site and seasons, suggesting potential differences in air mass circulation among locations - see for instance Innocente et al. (2017) for bacteria. Furthermore, in the present study the sites differ for their climate and orographic characteristics. The effect of climatic variables on airborne samples has been reported (Favero-Longo et al., 2014; Fröhlich-Nowoisky et al., 2016). Our findings are in line with previous metabarcoding and pyrosequencing studies, which have shown remarkable seasonal variation for fungal genera such as Alternaria, Cladosporium and Blumeria, likely reflecting the different life-styles, phenological differences and substrate preferences of the taxa (Fröhlich-Nowoisky et al., 2009; Yamamoto et al., 2012; Nicolaïsen et al., 2017). However, Nicolaïsen et al. (2017) highlighted that airborne fungal composition did not show any distinctive clustering based on sampling site, confirming that their location, within the climatic region studied, was not an important driver of the diversity of airborne fungal spores. Similarly to the study of Nicolaïsen et al. (2017) we also analyzed roof top samples, thus taking into consideration air masses with a likely greater mixing than that of air at lower elevations. Relative humidity is confirmed to be one of the main factors influencing fungal community (Sadyš et al., 2015), whereas pollen samples are mainly influenced by temperature and wind speed (Grinn-Gofroń et al., 2018). Nonetheless, it is known that certain fungi sporulate either during humid and dry periods, though, local weather events can distort the general pattern (Grinn-Gofroń et al., 2018). For example, in our survey we recovered Epicoccum, Pithomyces and Peniophora being most abundant in the drier summer period. For these reasons, extended areas and time frames should, therefore, be considered in future surveys in order to obtain more reliable information since local climatic phenomena may considerably affect the spreading of pollen and fungal spores. Sampling strategies could be improved further, i.e. by including sampling at additional ‘sub-stations’ in the same area for statistical support. This is, however, constrained by the availability of multiple sampling devices of the same type, and should consider a normalization of the microclimate variable among each sub-station.

Our study highlights the recurrent presence of several pathogenic, allergenic and invasive alien species (43 species detected) in airborne samples, as well as that of more inconspicuous and neglected taxa, such as lichens (25 species of lichenized fungi). In particular, concerning lichens, long distance dispersal through air may corroborate the wide distribution of certain species (e.g. Ötlör et al., 2010; Werth, 2011; Leavitt et al., 2018).

4.4. eDNA metabarcoding for aerobiology

The analysis of eDNA using metabarcoding approaches provides novel perspectives into complex communities from either aquatic,
terrestrial or aerial ecosystems. eDNA metabarcoding offers a faster, more direct and accurate method to capture a broader range of biodiversity than traditional morphology-based surveys (Johnson et al., 2019; Ruppert et al., 2019). Though there was a boom of eDNA metabarcoding studies applied to soil and water samples, in contrast extremely few ones have considered aerobiological specimens to date. Only recently, studies are focusing on the proper methodology to make the analysis of aerobiological samples straightforward by testing different sampling methodologies, DNA extraction methods and primer combinations (Johnson et al., 2019). Indeed, different eDNA extraction methods may lead to varying amounts of extracted DNA, with consequently different amplification rate and concentration of PCR products, phenomena which deserve further study and optimization according to the aim of the researches (Johnson et al., 2019). The application of airborne eDNA metabarcoding needs, therefore, to expand and to establish in aerobiology to augment the accuracy of data in biomonitoring studies, detection of invasive and allergenic species (either plants and fungi) or modelling of species dispersion.

To the best of our knowledge, this study is one of the few which applies eDNA metabarcoding analyses to airborne samples and the first which takes into account a nine-month-long survey on a wide geographic area to analyze simultaneously airborne plants and fungi. The protocols performed during the laboratory portion of the study were revised and improved from previous pilot study considering only airborne fungal eDNA (Banchi et al., 2018), extending the protocols to the simultaneous analyses of airborne plants and fungi. In addition to methodological developments, the implementation of eDNA metabarcoding enables the detection of higher biodiversity and provides insight into the temporal and spatial distribution of this diversity. DNA metabarcoding is proposed as a suitable and powerful tool for detecting rare, pathogenic and invasive species of both fungi and plants, and shows its potential to complement routine analyses of air monitoring. We anticipate that our study will serve as a springboard for future investigations of biodiversity monitoring and monitoring of invasive alien species both for facing human health and agricultural prevention issues.

Data accessibility

The sequence data are available at the NCBI short read repository under the accession number PRJNA576572.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Elisa Banchi:Investigation, Methodology, Formal analysis, Data curation, Writing - original draft, Writing - review & editing. Claudio G. Amertrano:Investigation, Methodology, Formal analysis, Data curation, Writing - original draft, Writing - review & editing. Enrico Tordoni:Formal analysis, Writing - original draft, Writing - review & editing. David Stankoviċ:Resources. Silvia Ongaro:Formal analysis. Mauro Trettich:Resources. Alberto Pallavicini:Conceptualization, Funding acquisition, Project administration, Resources. Silvia Ongaro:Formal analysis. Lucia Muggia:Conceptualization, Funding acquisition, Project administration, Investigation, Methodology, Formal analysis, Data curation, Writing - original draft, Writing - review & editing. Pierluigi Verardo:Resources. Francesca Tassan:Resources. Nadia Trobiani:Resources. Olga Moretti:Resources. Maria Francesca Borney:Resources. Stefania Lazzarini:Resources.

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Acknowledgments

The research was funded by the project Finanziamenti di Ateneo per progetti di Ricerca scientifica (FRA2016) assigned to LM by the University of Trieste. We thank Fiorella Florian and Fabrizia Gionechetti (University of Trieste, Italy) for technical help in the laboratory, Elisa Peressotti for suggestions about E. necator manipulation, and Silvia Vezzulli and Massimo Pindo (Edmund Mach Foundation, San Michele all’Adige, Italy) for Erysiphe necator spores and for DNA sequencing of some of the mock community samples, respectively. We also thank ARPA Friuli Venezia Giulia, Marche, Umbria, Valle d’Aosta and Veneto for providing meteorological data. The Grainger Bioinformatics Center, Science and Education, Field Museum of Natural History (Chicago, U.S.A.) is thanked for the offered genome sequencing facilities. Steven D. Leavitt is thanked for revising the English style of the text.

References


De Caceres, M., Legendre, P., 2009. Associations between species and groups of sites: in-
Dray, S., Belair, D., Blanchet, G., Boccard, D., Clappe, S., Guénard, G., Jombart, T.,
Mayol, E., Arietia, J.M., Jimenez, M.A., Martinez-Amsio, A., Garcia-Bonet, N., Dachs, J.,
Grinn-Gofro, 2018. An updated checklist of the vascular


