

Re-evaluation of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) as food additives

EFSA FAF Panel (EFSA Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings) | Laurence Castle | Monica Andreassen | Gabriele Aquilina | Maria Bastos | Polly Boon | Biagio Fallico | Reginald Fitzgerald | Maria Jose Frutos Fernandez | Bettina Grasl-Kraupp | Ursula Gundert-Remy | Rainer Gürtler | Eric Houdeau | Marcin Kurek | Henriqueta Louro | Patricia Morales | Sabina Passamonti | Salvatore Multari | Josef Daniel Rasinger | Ana Maria Rincon | Sam Vermeiren | Camilla Smeraldi

Correspondence: fip@efsa.europa.eu

The declarations of interest of all scientific experts active in EFSA's work are available at <https://ess.efsa.europa.eu/doi/doiweb/doisearch>

Abstract

The Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF) provides a scientific opinion re-evaluating the safety of the two food additives argon (E 938) and helium (E 939). Argon (Ar) and helium (He) are two noble gases, highly stable single atoms. Their chemical inertness is well known. Their physicochemical properties have served as a basis for their previous evaluations by SCF and JECFA, which have considered the use of these food additives safe even in the absence of a toxicological evaluation. Three business operators provided information in response to the call for data published by EFSA to support the re-evaluation of these two food additives with respect to their identity and specifications, manufacturing process (including the identification and quantification of potential impurities) and how they are applied to food to exert their technological function. Based on their physicochemical properties, both gases are considered by the Panel to be of low toxicological concern when used as food additives. The Panel concluded that the use of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) as food additives does not raise a safety concern. The Panel recommended an amendment of the existing EU specifications to introduce the respective CAS numbers.

KEYWORDS

argon, CAS No 7440-37-1, CAS No 7440-59-7, food additives, helium, noble gases, packaging gases

This is an open access article under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution-NoDerivs](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nd/4.0/) License, which permits use and distribution in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited and no modifications or adaptations are made.

© 2024 European Food Safety Authority. *EFSA Journal* published by Wiley-VCH GmbH on behalf of European Food Safety Authority.

CONTENTS

Abstract.....	1
1. Introduction	3
1.1. Background and Terms of Reference as provided by the European Commission	3
1.1.1. Background	3
1.1.2. Terms of Reference.....	3
1.2. Additional information	3
1.2.1. Existing authorisations and evaluations	3
2. Data and Methodologies.....	4
2.1. Data.....	4
2.2. Methodologies.....	4
3. Assessment	5
3.1. Technical data	5
3.1.1. Identity of the substances and specifications.....	5
3.1.1.1. Argon (E 938).....	5
3.1.1.2. Helium (E 939).....	5
3.1.2. Manufacturing process	6
3.1.3. Methods of analysis in food.....	7
3.1.4. Stability of the food additives and reaction and fate in food	7
3.2. Authorised uses and use levels.....	7
3.3. Exposure data.....	7
3.3.1. Reported use levels or data on analytical levels of argon (E 938).....	7
3.3.2. Summarised data extracted from the Mintel's global new products database	7
3.3.3. Information on uses retrieved from the published literature	8
3.4. Exposure estimate(s).....	8
3.5. Biological and toxicological data	8
4. Discussion.....	8
5. Conclusions.....	9
6. Recommendation.....	9
7. Documentation as provided to EFSA (if appropriate)	9
Abbreviations	9
Requestor	9
Question numbers	9
Erratum	9
Amendment.....	9
Copyright for non-EFSA content.....	10
Panel members	10
References.....	10
Appendix A.....	11

1 | INTRODUCTION

The present opinion deals with the re-evaluation of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) when used as food additives.

1.1 | Background and Terms of Reference as provided by the European Commission

1.1.1 | Background

Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008¹ of the European Parliament and of the Council on food additives requires that food additives are subject to a safety evaluation by the European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) before they are permitted for use in the European Union (EU). In addition, it is foreseen that food additives must be kept under continuous observation and must be re-evaluated by EFSA.

For this purpose, a programme for the re-evaluation of food additives that were already permitted in the European Union before 20 January 2009 has been set up under the Regulation (EU) No 257/2010.² This Regulation also foresees that food additives are re-evaluated whenever necessary in the light of changing conditions of use and new scientific information. For efficiency and practical purposes, the re-evaluation should, as far as possible, be conducted by group of food additives according to the main functional class to which they belong.

The order of priorities for the re-evaluation of the currently approved food additives should be set on the basis of the following criteria: the time since the last evaluation of a food additive by the Scientific Committee for Food (SCF) or by EFSA, the availability of new scientific evidence, the extent of use of a food additive in food and the human exposure to the food additive taking also into account the outcome of the Report from the Commission on Dietary Food Additive Intake in the EU of 2001.³ The report "Food additives in Europe 2000"⁴ submitted by the Nordic Council of Ministers to the Commission, provides additional information for the prioritisation of additives for re-evaluation. As colours were among the first additives to be evaluated, these food additives should be re-evaluated with a highest priority.

In 2003, the Commission already requested EFSA to start a systematic re-evaluation of authorised food additives. However, as a result of adoption of Regulation (EU) No 257/2010 the 2003 Terms of References are replaced by those below.

1.1.2 | Terms of Reference

The Commission asks the European Food Safety Authority to re-evaluate the safety of food additives already permitted in the Union before 2009 and to issue scientific opinions on these additives, taking especially into account the priorities, procedures and deadlines that are enshrined in the Regulation (EU) No 257/2010 of 25 March 2010 setting up a programme for the re-evaluation of approved food additives in accordance with the Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council on food additives.

1.2 | Additional information

1.2.1 | Existing authorisations and evaluations

Argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) are authorised as food additives in the EU in accordance with Annex II and Annex III to Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 on food additives and specific purity criteria have been defined in Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012.⁵

The use of argon (E 938) as food additive has been previously evaluated by the EU Scientific Committee for Food (SCF) in 1990, jointly with other packaging gases and propellants. The SCF opinion states the following: *'This rare gas is an elemental constituent of air. It is completely inert chemically. The Committee considers the establishment of an ADI unnecessary. Its use as a packaging gas and propellant is **toxicologically acceptable** provided a food grade specification is available'*.

EFSA could not retrieve a previous evaluation by the SCF of helium (E 939), however the Panel assumed that similar considerations to those made for argon may have applied to its evaluation.

Specifications for both argon (INS No 938) and helium (INS No 939) were established at the 53rd JECFA meeting in 1999 (JECFA, 1999a, 1999b) but no toxicological monographs were prepared. JECFA specifications indicate that the functional use of argon is as a packaging gas whereas helium is reported as a processing aid.

¹Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 16 December 2008 on food additives. OJ L 354, 31.12.2008, p. 16–33.

²Commission Regulation (EU) No 257/2010 of 25 March 2010 setting up a programme for the re-evaluation of approved food additives in accordance with Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council on food additives. OJ L 80, 26.3.2010, p. 19–27.

³European Commission, 2001. Report from the Commission on Dietary Food Additive Intake in the European Union. Brussels. COM(2001) 542 final.

⁴Food Additives in Europe 2000, Status of safety assessments of food additives presently permitted in the EU, Nordic Council of Ministers, TemaNord 2002, 560.

⁵Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012 of 9 March 2012 laying down specifications for food additives listed in Annexes II and III to Regulation (EC) no 1333/2008 of the European Parliament and of the Council. OJ L 83, 22.3.2012, p. 1.

In addition to the authorised uses as food additive, in the EU, argon is also listed in Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) No 2019/934 of 12 March 2019 supplementing Regulation (EU) No 1308/2013⁶ on authorised oenological practices for use in the oenological process of bubbling and among the permitted gases and packaging gases.

Helium gas is listed among the substances Generally Recognised as Safe (GRAS) by the United States Food and Drug Administration (US FDA) after an opinion of the Select Committee on GRAS issued in 1979 (US FDA, [online](#)).

The Minister of Health, Labour and Welfare (MHLW) of Japan lists both argon and helium among the food additives permitted for use in Japan (MHLW, [online](#)).

In the EU, argon is permitted as an antioxidant in cosmetic products (European Commission database-CosIng⁷).

Both argon (EINECS No 231-147-0; CAS No 7440-37-1) and helium (EINECS No 231-168-5; CAS No 7440-59-7) are included in Annex IV to Regulation (EC) No 1907/2006⁸ (REACH Regulation) among the substances that are exempted from registration with ECHA because they are considered to cause minimum risk to human health or the environment because of their intrinsic properties.

The EU Pharmacopoeia contains monographs for both argon (European Pharmacopoeia 11.6, [2024a](#)) and helium intended for medicinal use (European Pharmacopoeia 11.6, [2024b](#)).

2 | DATA AND METHODOLOGIES

2.1 | Data

The Panel was not provided with a newly submitted dossier. EFSA launched a public call for data to collect information from interested parties.⁹ With respect to the data and information specified in Article 4 of Regulation (EU) No 257/2010, the Panel noted that some information falling under points (a)–(d) was made available to EFSA by three interested business operators (IBOs) (Documentation provided to EFSA No. 1, 2, 3).

The Panel conducted an extensive, open-ended literature search for the identification of any relevant literature published on the two gases as foreseen under point (e) of Article 4 of Regulation (EU) No 257/2010 (see Appendix A). For the present opinion, this task was limited to the review of selected publications that were deemed relevant by the Panel for the safety evaluation of these two gases when used as food additives.

The Mintel's Global New Products Database (GNPD) was used to check for the uses of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) in food and beverage products and food supplements within the EU's market. The Mintel's GNPD is an online database that contains the compulsory ingredient information present on the label of numerous products.

2.2 | Methodologies

This opinion was formulated following the principles described in the EFSA Guidance on transparency with regard to scientific aspects of risk assessment (EFSA, [2009](#)) and following the relevant existing guidance documents from the EFSA Scientific Committee.

The FAF Panel assessed the safety of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) as food additives in line with the principles laid down in Regulation (EU) 257/2010 and in the relevant guidance documents: Guidance on submission for food additive evaluations by the Scientific Committee on Food (SCF, [2001](#)) and the Guidance for submission for food additive evaluations in 2012 (EFSA ANS Panel, [2012](#)).

In the context of this re-evaluation, the Panel took into account the 'Conceptual framework for the risk assessment of certain food additives re-evaluated under Commission Regulation (EC) No 257/2010' (EFSA ANS Panel, [2014](#)).

⁶Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2019/934 of 12 March 2019 supplementing Regulation (EU) No 1308/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards wine-growing areas where the alcoholic strength may be increased, authorised oenological practices and restrictions applicable to the production and conservation of grapevine products, the minimum percentage of alcohol for by-products and their disposal, and publication of OIV files. OJ L 149, 7.6.2019, p. 1–52.

⁷Available online: <http://ec.europa.eu/consumers/cosmetics/cosing/index.cfm?fuseaction=search.simple>

⁸Regulation (EC) No 1907/2006 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2006 concerning the Registration, Evaluation, Authorisation and Restriction of Chemicals (REACH), establishing a European Chemicals Agency, amending Directive 1999/45/EC and repealing Council Regulation (EEC) No 793/93 and Commission Regulation (EC) No 1488/94 as well as Council Directive 76/769/EEC and Commission Directives 91/155/EEC, 93/67/EEC, 93/105/EC and 2000/21/EC. OJ L 396, 30/12/2006, p. 1–849.

⁹Call for data for the re-evaluation of food additives in gaseous form. Published 28 June 2023. Available from: <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/call/call-data-re-evaluation-food-additives-gaseous-form>

3 | ASSESSMENT

3.1 | Technical data

3.1.1 | Identity of the substances and specifications

3.1.1.1 | Argon (E 938)

Argon (Ar) is a noble gas with an atomic weight of 40 g/mol. The EU specifications describe argon as a colourless, odourless and non-flammable gas.

The specifications for argon (E 938) as defined in Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012 and by JECFA (1999a) are listed in Table 1.

TABLE 1 Specifications for the food additive argon (E 938) according to Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012 and JECFA (1999a).

Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012		JECFA (1999a)
Synonyms		INS No. 938
Definition		
Einecs	231-147-0	
CAS Number		7440-37-1
Chemical name	Argon	
Chemical formula	Ar	
Atomic weight	40	40.0
Assay	Not less than 99%	Not less than 99.0% by volume
Description	Colourless, odourless, non-flammable gas	Colourless and odourless gas
Identification		
Flame test		The flame of a burning splinter of wood is extinguished when inserted into an upright test tube filled with argon
Purity		
Water content	Not more than 0.05%	Passes test ^a
Methane and other hydrocarbons	Not more than 100 µL/L (calculated as methane)	
Oxygen, nitrogen, hydrogen		Not more than 1% in combination ^a
Odour		No appreciable odour is discernible

^aA specific test is described in the JECFA specifications (1999a).

The Panel noted that the purity required for argon used for medicinal use (minimum 99.995 per cent v/v) is higher than the one indicated in the EU specifications for argon when used as food additive (not less than 99%). The specified impurities for argon for medicinal use are oxygen and water. Nitrogen and methane are listed as other detectable impurities (EU Phar 11.0).

The Panel also considered that the CAS number 7440-37-1 should be included in the existing EU specifications for E 938. An IBO has provided a proposal for a revision of the existing specifications for increasing the purity assay to 99.5% and introducing a limit of < 500 ppm for oxygen, however this proposal was not supported by analytical data (Documentation provided to EFSA n.1).

3.1.1.2 | Helium (E 939)

Helium (He) is a noble gas with an atomic weight of 4 g/mol. The EU specifications describe helium as a colourless, odourless and non-flammable gas.

The specifications for helium (E 939) as defined in Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012 and by JECFA (1999b) are listed in Table 2.

TABLE 2 Specifications for the food additive helium (E 939) according to Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012 and JECFA (1999b).

Commission Regulation (EU) No 231/2012		JECFA (1999b)
Synonyms		INS No. 939
Definition		
Einecs	231-168-5	
CAS Number		7440-59-7
Chemical name		Helium
Chemical formula		He
Atomic weight		4.0
Assay	Not less than 99%	Not less than 99.0% by volume
Description	Colourless, odourless, non-flammable gas	Colourless and odourless gas
Identification		
Flame test		The flame of a burning splinter of wood is extinguished when inserted into an upright test tube filled with helium
GC test		See Method of Assay ^a
Purity		
Water content	Not more than 0.05%	
Methane and other hydrocarbons	Not more than 100 µL/L (calculated as methane)	
Air		Not more than 1%, by volume ^a
Carbon monoxide		Not more than 10 µL/L, by volume
Odour		No appreciable odour is discernible

^aA specific test is described in the JECFA specifications (1999b).

The Panel noted that the purity required for helium used for medicinal use (minimum 99.5 per cent v/v) is higher than that indicated in the EU specifications for helium used as a food additive (not less than 99%). The specified impurities for helium for medicinal use are oxygen, methane and water (EU Phar 11.0).

The Panel also considered that the CAS number 7440-59-7 should be included in the existing EU specifications for E 938.

One IBO has provided a summary of analytical results from 5 samples from different sources, using gas chromatography (GC). The results provided were in compliance with existing specifications and no changes were proposed (Documentation provided to EFSA n.1).

3.1.2 | Manufacturing process

Existing EU specifications for argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) do not contain any information on the manufacturing process(es) used for the production of these food additives.

According to information available in the public domain, argon is the third most abundant gas in air and is obtained from the fractional distillation of liquefied air into oxygen, nitrogen and argon, at cryogenic temperatures (Ceylan et al., 2017).

Argon can also be recovered from the exhaust streams of certain ammonia plants (Healy, 1992). The Panel noted that this manufacturing process could explain why methane is one of the listed impurities in the existing food additive specifications.

In response to the call for data, one interested business operator (IBO) has provided information confirming that bulk argon (E 938) is generated from industrial air separation unit plants and stored and distributed as a cryogenic liquid. The gas intended for use in food is packaged into cylinders/bundles/minibulk as single gas or in mixtures with other gases. (Documentation provided to EFSA n.1).

Helium is reported to be extracted from natural gas through fractional distillation, with the intention of being separated from hydrocarbons and nitrogenous compounds. The initial stage of the industrial process involves natural gas extraction and processing, where helium is treated as a valuable by-product and separated through cryogenic processes from other components, e.g. carbon dioxide, hydrogen, nitrogen and hydrocarbons. At this point, the so-called ‘crude helium’ is obtained, with a purity of 60%–80%. To achieve a higher purity, different gases, such as hydrogen, oxygen and water are separated from the crude helium to produce ‘Grade-A’ helium, i.e. helium with a purity of 99.99% (Serra Leal et al., 2023).

The Panel noted that, according to the monographs in the EU Pharmacopoeia, for the two gases for medicinal use, argon is obtained by fractional distillation of ambient air while helium is obtained by separation from natural gas.

In response to the call for data, one IBO has provided information confirming that helium is manufactured from natural gas through cryogenic separation and concentrated in a pressure swing. The pure gas is subsequently liquified. According to the IBO, at the temperature in which liquid helium is present at pressure atmosphere all possible impurities would be solid. (Documentation provided to EFSA n.1).

3.1.3 | Methods of analysis in food

No business operators or other interested party has provided information in response to the call for data either on argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) with respect to this aspect.

Since no information was provided on how the food additives are applied to food to exert their intended technological function (e.g. at which stage of the manufacturing, processing, packaging and/or distribution of foods, how the food additive is included in the food, under which conditions of temperature and pressure, etc.), the Panel after performing a search of the literature to address this point, could not identify relevant information on methods of analysis.

3.1.4 | Stability of the food additives and reaction and fate in food

No IBO or other interested party has provided data in response to the call for data on either argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) with respect to this aspect.

The physicochemical properties of the two noble gases are universally acknowledged and served as the basis for the original evaluations by other bodies. The Panel was also of the view that argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) can be considered chemically inert under most conditions and unable to form stable compounds at temperatures normally used in food preparation/processing/storage/packaging.

3.2 | Authorised uses and use levels

Currently, argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) are authorised food additives in the EU at *quantum satis* (QS) in all food categories as set by Annex II to Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008, including foods for infants and young children. Additionally, according to Annex III, Parts 2, 3, 4 and 5 of Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008, E 938 and E 939 are permitted also at QS to be used in food additive preparations, food enzymes, flavourings and nutrients.

According to one IBO, argon (E938) is widely used as a food additive in the food industry mainly as inert gas in modified atmosphere packaging, blanketing and dispensing. The function exerted by this food additive is the removal of oxygen in contact with food in order to avoid oxidation processes and preventing the growth of bacteria (Documentation provided to EFSA n.1).

A second IBO reported the use of argon (E 938) as packaging gas for nutrient preparations but no use levels (Documentation provided to EFSA n. 2).

With respect to helium (E 939), the IBO stated that this gas can be used in modified atmospheric packaging for specifically sensitive foodstuff. Helium can be detected at low concentrations in the surrounding atmosphere and hence can be used to detect leaks in food packages. The IBO did not indicate use levels for either of these applications (Documentation provided to EFSA No.1).

3.3 | Exposure data

3.3.1 | Reported use levels or data on analytical levels of argon (E 938)

Use level data of argon (E 938) as a packaging gas in food category (FC) 14.2.4 'Fruit wine and made wine' were provided by one IBO (Documentation provided to EFSA No. 3). Within this FC, the reported use levels in 'fruit wine-cocktail, aromatised' were 1000 mg/L and 1500 mg/L for the typical and the maximum use level, respectively.

3.3.2 | Summarised data extracted from the Mintel's global new products database

The Mintel's GNPD was used for checking the labelling of food and beverage products and food supplements for argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) within the EU's food market.¹⁰ This search indicated that neither gas is listed in the labels of any food product.

¹⁰Missing Cyprus, Luxembourg and Malta.

3.3.3 | Information on uses retrieved from the published literature

Based on selected information retrieved from the published literature, argon is used in food packaging to increase the shelf life, preserve the flavour and reduce the oxidation of perishable foods (Spencer & Humphreys, 2001). When introduced into the packaging, argon creates a modified atmosphere that reduces the amount of available oxygen and moisture, hence hindering a series of chemical reactions, such as hydrolysis and peroxidation. Within drinks, argon is added to wine barrels to remove the excess of air, as it settles above the liquid protecting the wine from souring and oxidation. In dairy products, argon could be used to inactivate the bacteria in raw milk so as to increase the shelf life of milk and dairy products (Kasih, Mangindaan, Ningrum, Sebastian, & Widyaningrum, 2021).

Similarly, helium is used by the food industry, introduced into the packaging, to aid the long-term storage of foods. The scientific literature provides numerous examples of helium being used in post-harvest treatment of food, e.g. to control bacterial growth in packaged raw fish (Üçok et al., 2024) and minimally processed vegetables (Silveira et al., 2014), to inactivate pathogens in processed meats (Kim et al., 2011) and to reduce the content of biogenic amines in red wines (Niedzwiedz et al., 2022).

3.4 | Exposure estimate(s)

Owing to the limited information on the applications of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) in foods, the dietary exposure to these food additives was not estimated.

Nevertheless, it can be assumed that dietary exposure, if any, will be low. When used as a packaging gas to create an inert atmosphere, the concentration of argon and helium in the packaged foodstuffs will be low due to the fact that the gases have only a low solubility. The solubility of argon and helium in water at STP (standard temperature and pressure, 25°C and 1 atm of the packaging gas.) is approximately 56 mg/L and 1.6 mg/L respectively (IUPAC, 1979, 1980). The solubility of argon and helium in 1-octanol (considered by the Panel to be a suitable simulant for food oils and fats, in the absence of readily available solubility data for oils and fats) is ca. 330 mg/L and 3.0 mg/L respectively (IUPAC, 1979, 1980). Since the concentration of both gases in foodstuffs of any character (dry, aqueous, fatty, mixed) will always be low, the dietary exposure via said foods would be low too.

3.5 | Biological and toxicological data

Argon and helium are two noble gases, highly stable single atoms. Their chemical inertness is well known and therefore, intrinsic toxic properties have not to be considered.

The Panel noted that inhalation exposure may lead to suffocation by displacing oxygen from the air which is inhaled. It is expected that the inhalation exposure for the consumers resulting from use in foods of argon and helium is extremely low, and therefore this effect has not been considered relevant for assessing the safety of the two gases as food additives.

4 | DISCUSSION

The present opinion deals with the re-evaluation of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) when used as food additives.

Argon (Ar) and helium (He) are two noble gases, highly stable single atoms. Their chemical inertness is well known.

The two food additives, argon (E 938) and helium (E 939), are authorised in the EU at *quantum satis* (QS) in all food categories as set by Annex II to Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008, including foods for infants and young children. Additionally, according to Annex III, Parts 2, 3, 4 and 5 of Regulation (EC) No 1333/2008, E 938 and E 939 are permitted to be used in food additive preparations, food enzymes, flavourings and nutrients, again at QS.

One business operator provided information in response to the call for data published by EFSA to support the re-evaluation of these two food additives with respect to their identity and specifications, manufacturing process (including compliance with existing specifications) and how they are applied to food to exert their technological function (e.g. at which stage of the manufacturing, processing, packaging and/or distribution of foods, how the food additive is included in the food, under which conditions of temperature and pressure, etc.). Two IBOs reported uses of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) as a packaging gases in one food category (Documentation provided to EFSA No. 1, 2). Use of helium (E 939) in fruit wine and made wine was also reported (Documentation provided to EFSA No. 3).

A search of the Mintel database for foods that report the use of these food additives on their labels returned no entry, suggesting that the use of these food additives does not serve any other technological function other than packaging gases, as also reported by the IBOs.

Based on their physicochemical properties, both gases are considered by the Panel to be of low toxicological concern when used as food additives, as described in the 2014 ANS Panel 'Conceptual framework for the risk assessment of certain food additives re-evaluated under Commission Regulation (EC) No 257/2010' (EFSA ANS Panel, 2014). This is in line with considerations by other scientific bodies (SCF, JECFA) and the same rationale has been followed in the context of the REACH Regulation to exempt the two gases from registration with ECHA. No information was available on the potential presence

of impurities of toxicological concern resulting from the manufacturing process(es) applied to the production of the food additives E 938 and E 939. The Panel however noted that a minimum purity of 99.0% is required to comply with existing EU specifications and that the listed impurities do not raise a concern.

Despite the absence of a full dataset covering detailed information on exposure and toxicity, the Panel considered that the use of these food additives does not raise a safety concern. For both gases, the potential presence of impurities, currently unlisted in the EU Specifications, represents a minor uncertainty.

5 | CONCLUSIONS

The Panel concluded that the use of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) as food additives does not raise a safety concern.

6 | RECOMMENDATION

The Panel recommended that the European Commission considers amending existing EU specifications for argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) introducing the CAS numbers 7440-37-1 and 7440-59-7, respectively.

7 | DOCUMENTATION AS PROVIDED TO EFSA (IF APPROPRIATE)

1. EIGA's answer to the call for data for the re-evaluation of food additives in gaseous form (pp. 59-65). March 2024. Submitted by European Industrial Gases Association (EIGA) AISBL.
2. SNE submission to the EFSA call for data for the re-evaluation of food additives in gaseous form. March 2024. Submitted by Specialised Nutrition Europe (SNE)
3. Response to Call for data for the re-evaluation of food additives in gaseous form. April 2024. Submitted by Fruchtwein- und Fruchtschaumwein-Industrie e.V.

ABBREVIATIONS

ANS	Food additives and nutrient sources added to food
CAS	Chemical Abstracts Service
ECHA	European Chemicals Agency
EINECS	European INventory of Existing Commercial chemical Substances
FAF	Food Additives and Flavourings
FC	Food Category
GNPD	Global New Products Database
GRAS	generally recognised as safe
IBO	interested business operator
JECFA	Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives
MHLW	Minister of Health, Labour and Welfare
QS	<i>quantum satis</i>
SCF	Scientific Committee for Food
STP	standard temperature and pressure
US FDA	United States Food and Drug Administration

REQUESTOR

European Commission

QUESTION NUMBERS

EFSA- Q- 2011- 00712, EFSA- Q- 2011- 00713

ERRATUM

Corrections were introduced in the opinion to integrate information provided to EFSA in response to the call for data that was inadvertently overlooked during the preparation of the scientific opinion. The updated information is referred to in the opinion as Documentation provided to EFSA No.1 and No 2 . These corrections affect the overall outcome of this scientific opinion. To avoid confusion, the earlier version has been removed from the EFSA Journal but is available upon request.

AMENDMENT

An editorial correction to the text of section 3.2 and section 4 was carried out that does not materially affect the contents or outcome of this scientific output. To avoid confusion, the original version of the output has been removed from the EFSA Journal, but is available on request.

COPYRIGHT FOR NON-EFSA CONTENT

EFSA may include images or other content for which it does not hold copyright. In such cases, EFSA indicates the copyright holder and users should seek permission to reproduce the content from the original source.

PANEL MEMBERS

Monica Andreassen, Gabriele Aquilina, Maria Bastos, Polly Boon, Laurence Castle, Biagio Fallico, Reginald Fitzgerald, Maria Jose Frutos Fernandez, Bettina Grasl-Kraupp, Ursula Gundert-Remy, Rainer Gürtler, Eric Houdeau, Marcin Kurek, Henriqueta Louro, Patricia Morales, and Sabina Passamonti.

REFERENCES

- Ceylan, M., Jobson, M., & Smith, R. (2017). Membrane–cryogenic distillation hybrid processes for cost-effective argon production from air. *Computer Aided Chemical Engineering*, 40, 1117–1122. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-444-63965-3.50188-4>
- EFSA (European Food Safety Authority). (2009). Guidance of the scientific committee on transparency in the scientific aspects of risk assessments carried out by EFSA. Part 2: General principles. *EFSA Journal*, 7(5), 1051. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2009.1051>
- EFSA ANS Panel (EFSA Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources Added to Food). (2012). Guidance for submission for food additive evaluations. *EFSA Journal*, 10(7), <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2012.2760>
- EFSA ANS Panel (EFSA Panel on Food Additives and Nutrient Sources Added to Food). (2014). Statement on a conceptual framework for the risk assessment of certain food additives re-evaluated under commission regulation (EU) No 257/2010. *EFSA Journal*, 12(6), 3697. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2014.3697>
- European Pharmacopoeia 11.6. (2024a). Argon. EDQM, Council of Europe. Implementation: 01/2024:2407.
- European Pharmacopoeia 11.6. (2024b). Helium. EDQM, Council of Europe. Implementation: 01/2024:2155.
- Healy, M. J. (1992). Argon production from ammonia-plant purge gas. *Gas Separation & Purification*, 6(4), 191–196. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0950-4214\(92\)80021-A](https://doi.org/10.1016/0950-4214(92)80021-A)
- IUPAC Analytical Chemistry Division, Committee on Equilibrium Data. (1979). Subcommittee of Solubility Data. Solubility data series. Volume 1. Helium and neon. Gas Solubilities.
- IUPAC Analytical Chemistry Division, Committee on Equilibrium Data. (1980). Subcommittee of Solubility Data. Solubility Data Series. Volume 4. Argon. Gas Solubilities.
- JECFA (Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives). (1999a). Argon. Fifty-third meeting of the joint FAO/WHO expert committee on food additives. FNP 52 Add 7. https://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/jecfa_additives/docs/Monograph1/Additive-042.pdf
- JECFA (Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives). (1999b). Helium. Fifty-third meeting of the joint FAO/WHO expert committee on food additives. FNP 52 Add 7. https://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/jecfa_additives/docs/Monograph1/Additive-221.pdf
- Kasih, T. P., Mangindaan, D., Ningrum, A. S., Sebastian, C., & Widyaningrum, D. (2021). Bacterial inactivation by using non thermal argon plasma jet and its application study for non thermal raw milk processing. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 794(1), 012104. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/794/1/012104>
- Kim, B., Yun, H., Jung, S., Jung, Y., Jung, H., Choe, W., & Jo, C. (2011). Effect of atmospheric pressure plasma on inactivation of pathogens inoculated onto bacon using two different gas compositions. *Food Microbiology*, 28, 9–13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2010.07.022>
- MHLW (The Minister of Health, Labour and Welfare). (online). https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/seisakunitsuite/bunya/kenkou_iryou/shokuhin/syokuten/index_00012.html
- Niedzwiedz, I., Płotka-Wasyłka, J., Kapusta, I., Simeonov, V., Stój, A., Waśko, A., Pawlat, J., & Polak-Berecka, M. (2022). The impact of cold plasma on the phenolic composition and biogenic amine content of red wine. *Food Chemistry*, 381, 132257. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2022.132257>
- SCF (Scientific Committee for Food). (1990). Report of the scientific Committee for Food on a first series of food additives of various technological functions. Luxembourg. 32 pp. https://food.ec.europa.eu/system/files/2020-12/sci-com_scf_reports_25.pdf
- SCF (Scientific Committee for Food). (2001). Guidance on submissions for food additive evaluations by the scientific committee on food. Brussels. 42 pp. https://ec.europa.eu/food/fs/sc/scf/out98_en.pdf
- Serra Leal, J. S., Incer-Valverde, J., & Morosuk, T. (2023). Helium: Sources, applications, supply, and demand. *Gases*, 3(4), 181–183. <https://doi.org/10.3390/gases3040013>
- Silveira, A. C., Araneda, C., Hinojosa, A., & Escalona, V. H. (2014). Effect of non-conventional modified atmosphere packaging on fresh cut watercress (*Nasturtium officinale* R. Br.) quality. *Postharvest Biology and Technology*, 92, 114–120. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.postharvbio.2013.12.012>
- Spencer, K. C., & Humphreys, D. J. (2001). Argon packaging and processing preserves and enhances flavor, freshness, and shelf life of foods. <https://www.webofscience.com/wos/woscc/full-record/WOS:000181174600020>
- Üçok, D., Akan, T., Kartal, S., Tosun, Ş. Y., Mol, S., Coşansu, S., Doğruyol, H., Ulusoy, Ş., & Bostan, K. (2024). An opportunity for post-harvest seafood safety: Atmospheric pressure air or helium cold plasma to control salmonella Enteritidis in sea bass. *International Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 59, 3773–3780. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijfs.17118>
- US FDA. (online). Select Committee on GRAS Substances (SCOGS) Opinion: Helium gas. <https://wayback.archive-it.org/7993/20171031063926/https://www.fda.gov/Food/IngredientsPackagingLabeling/GRAS/SCOGS/ucm260424.htm>

How to cite this article: EFSA FAF Panel (EFSA Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings), Castle, L., Andreassen, M., Aquilina, G., Bastos, M., Boon, P., Fallico, B., Fitzgerald, R., Frutos Fernandez, M. J., Grasl-Kraupp, B., Gundert-Remy, U., Gürtler, R., Houdeau, E., Kurek, M., Louro, H., Morales, P., Passamonti, S., Multari, S., Rasinger, J. D., ... Smeraldi, C. (2024). Re-evaluation of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) as food additives. *EFSA Journal*, 22(10), e9048. <https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2024.9048>

APPENDIX A

Protocol for a comprehensive literature search supporting the re-evaluation of argon (E 938) and helium (E 939) as food additives

A.1 | EXTENSIVE LITERATURE SEARCH

A.1.1. | Methodology

Two separate literature searches were conducted in May 2024 to identify relevant studies on the relationships between gases and food, manufacturing methods and impurities. The first search, focused on argon (E 938) and yielded 2109, 2267 and 1431 studies for the argon and food, manufacturing methods and impurities searches, respectively. The second search, focused on helium (E 939) and yielded 1525, 2525 and 1670 studies for the corresponding searches. Both searches were performed in Scopus, Web of Science and Scifinder-n, limited to English-language studies and were conducted by an information specialist at EFSA.

Following duplicate removal using Endnote (ver. 20), studies retrieved from the literature searches were uploaded to DistillerSR (ver. 2.35) for artificial intelligence (AI) assisted title and abstract screening using inclusion and exclusion criteria outlined in Table A.1. Following screening, publications deemed relevant by the Panel for the safety evaluation of these two gases were included in the present opinion.

TABLE A.1 Inclusion/exclusion criteria applied to the literature search for argon (E 938) and helium (E 939).

Inclusion criteria	Exclusion criteria
Studies that investigate the manufacturing process and related specifications of argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) including: (i) information on manufacturing process, (ii) presence of toxicologically relevant impurities and related specifications	Studies that do not investigate argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) as food additives or their manufacturing processes for use as food additives
Studies that examine the reaction and fate of argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) in food	Studies that do not provide information on the reaction and fate of argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) in food
Studies that provide information on the estimation of dietary exposure to argon (E 938) or helium (E 939), including (i) information on applications as food additives, (ii) information on uses and use levels and (iii) information on residual levels of argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) in foods	Studies that do not provide information on dietary exposure to argon (E 938) or helium (E 939)
	Studies that do not report on applications, uses and use levels of argon (E 938) or helium (E 939)
	Studies that do not report on residual levels of argon (E 938) or helium (E 939) in foods
	Studies that focus on food additives in gaseous form other than argon (E 938) or helium (E 939)
	Studies that do not provide original data or reviews (e.g. editorials, opinion pieces, case reports)

A.2 | Results

The final numbers of references that were screened, after removal of duplicates (based on title, year, author, journal, volume, issue and page numbers) were 5807 for argon (E 938) and 5820 for helium (E 939). Following AI assisted screening using DistillerSR, publications deemed relevant by the Panel for the safety evaluation of these two gases were included in the present opinion.